

**PROCEEDINGS OF THE BOARD OF HEALTH SPECIAL MEETING  
UW Extension  
1150 Bellevue Street, Green Bay, Wisconsin  
Tuesday, December 15, 2015  
5:30 PM**

---

**Present:** Jay Tibbetts, Audrey Murphy, Harold Pfotenhauer, Karen Sanchez, Richard Schadewald and Susan Paulus Smith

**Excused:** Joe Van Deurzen

**Staff Present:** Chua Xiong, Rob Gollman, Ann Steinberger, Debbie Armbruster, Anne Morris, Kevin Pontius, Zach Kroening, Juliana Ruenzel, Carolyn Harvey (intern), Patti Zich (minutes recorder)

**\*\*NOTE: These minutes are a verbatim transcript of the December 15, 2015 meeting as requested by the Board of Health.\*\***

**Audrey Murphy:** Good Evening everyone. Can you hear me? I'm calling the meeting of the Brown County Board of Health to order and I'd like to welcome all of you who are with us this evening. And for your information and for the rest of the Board members we are being recorded tonight by Brown County.

**Richard Schadewald:** NewEye. It's a Brown County initiative. It's just ah, ah, right over there and so at some point we will be getting, not tonight, but at some point, we will be getting the online streaming of our county meetings so people can watch on the internet. So this is a test.

**Audrey Murphy:** So it's important you know that. Ah, we are going to begin our evening with public comments and before we do, ah, so that we have an orderly meeting one person at a time is going to speak. You will be recognized by the chair and will you please give us your name and your address for our records and because there's many of you here we are going to limit your comments to approximately 3 minutes and your comments have to be addressed to the Board only. So with that I am going to open it up to the public and we'll begin.

### **1. Public Comments**

**Jason Miller:** Do you want me to use the microphone?

**Audrey Murphy:** Sure. Please do.

**Jason Miller:** Sure. First I will give you my name. My name is Jason Miller. I am here on behalf of State Representative Andre Jacque. Ah, members of the Brown County Board of Health, thank you for holding this special meeting tonight, and for allowing public comments regarding the Shirley Wind Farm and its harmful, disruptive, debilitating effects on my constituent's health as you announce your next steps in regard to the human health hazard represented by industrial wind turbines. While I am regrettably unable to appear before you tonight due to legislative obligations in Madison I feel it is important to give to my and my

constituents concerns in this matter and greatly appreciate the willingness of my Chief of Staff, Jason Miller, to do so instead. The results of low frequency noise studies both in Glenmore and across the globe provide tremendous validation to the numerous area residents I have been in contact with whose health has been adversely affected by wind turbines. I pray they will be able to accomplish a meaningful recovery of quality of life. Your actions will undoubtedly have a significant impact on future legislative consideration of public health and safety in relation to industrial wind turbines. I strongly applaud the past efforts of the Board of Health in arriving at this point adhering to the Brown County Health Department's mission to 'protect and promote individual and community health throughout education, regulation and leadership to empower community members to attain well-being across the life span.' I believe that a halt to the operation of the present turbines in both appropriate consistent with the Board's previous findings and backed by a per ponderous of evidence. Thank you for your deliberations on this issue and your attention to the requests made by myself and my constituents. Sincerely, State Representative Andre Jacque, 2<sup>nd</sup> Assembly District. Thank you.

**Audrey Murphy:** Thank you Sir. Anyone else wishing to address the Board? Yes Sir.

**Elizabeth Ebertz:** My name is Elizabeth Ebertz. I live at N9192 Pine Road, St. Cloud, Wisconsin 53079. I would like to thank the Brown County Board of Health for letting me speak this evening. I live in the Blue Sky Green Field Wind Farms. I was not opposed to the turbines like most people it was green energy. My husband and I received a letter from We Energies asking if we would allow them to put wire through a section of our land. With no money exchanged, we signed it and sent it back. Big mistake. Because when I called about waking up two-three times a night I tried telling them sometimes I hear noise and sometimes it just wakes me up. They checked into what I told them, came back with the results and We Energy could not find anything wrong. I kept calling and stating that I am still having problems sleeping. Now We Energies is telling me that they are machines and they, and machines make noise. So, on July 16<sup>th</sup>, July 15<sup>th</sup> to the 26<sup>th</sup>, the turbines were turned off for three weeks. They were undergoing a mandatory testing according to We Energies spokesman Barry McNectal, Neclik. I am sorry, I mispronounced it. It was a great relief when they turned the turbines off. My biggest surprise was going up and down my steps without any pain in my legs and joints. I could work in my garden and flower beds without wearing ear protection. It felt so good not having headaches, ringing in my ears, dizziness, nauseous, loss of balance. My blood pressure was good and I could sleep 8-10 hours without being woke up. We Energies started them back up July 26<sup>th</sup> to the 28<sup>th</sup>. I woke up at midnight with a severe headache and was nauseous and could, could not get back to sleep. So I know that my symptoms I am having are a result from the turbines. But We Energy will not do anything about our health problems. We Energies just keeps denying it. Now after seven years, I have a bed in my basement to sleep. I have, it has helped a little but it is just not the same. My grandkids ask me why I am sleeping in the basement. Because I am not getting my sleep. Why grandma? Because the turbines wake me up at night. Can't you tell them to turn them off so we can sleep? Any questions or anything.

**Audrey Murphy:** No, but thank you for your comments. Yes sir.

**James Mueller:** My name is James Mueller. I live in Fond du Lac County in Blue Sky Green Field; We Energies wind turbine project. We have been living in our home for 37 years. We are not opposed to wind turbines. We are opposed to placing them too close to our homes. We have been living with this for 7 years. Our health issues come from sleep deprivation, headaches, earaches, ringing of ears, loss of concentration and just pure exhaustion from lack of sleep. We have gotten as little as 2 hours of sleep due to the noise and effects of the wind turbines. We are not the only ones with these issues. Jim Vollmer and Bruce Dalcom moved out of their homes but have since gained their health back. Some residents have moved their beds in the basements of their homes. Others are constantly seeking doctoring to alleviate the health issues that they are having. We have filed complaints with our town, Fond du Lac County Board of Health, We Energies, Wisconsin Public Service and our representatives. We have attended three Senate hearings in Madison. We sent Jim Lipinski at the Wisconsin Public Service complaints about the health issues we were facing due to the wind turbines being too close to our homes. We contacted Jim numerous times. Jim said he had all the information he needed and would see what he could do for us. We then saw Jim Lipinski testify at a hearing at Forest County for a proposal of another wind turbine project. Jim testified that there was not one formal complaint in Fond du Lac County. When asked what a formal complaint is; a formal complaint must come from We Energies. All our, citizens must call We Energies with their complaint. All our complaints and calls to the Wisconsin Public Service and We Energies did not count. Our health issues have not even recognized in that hearing. It was like having your home burglarized or being physically attacked and the only one that can file a complaint is the burglar or the attacker. Um, I would say we probably called We Energies at least a hundred times through the years because we can't sleep nights. We are told the same thing. Now, they told us originally they were as quiet as refrigerators running. That they don't affect you. Now they tell us they are machines and machines make noise and that is what they do, the same issues that affected Brown County residents in Shirley Wind Project. Residents in your county also had to leave their homes. People's health should be more important than corporate profit. Our most important asset is our homes. Being tortured in our homes with no consequences to the owners of these wind turbine projects is not acceptable. We have asked the Brown County Board to protect its citizens but also assist other county boards of health such as Fond du Lac County to understand the health hazards associated with wind turbines that they are way to close our homes. Please help us.

**Audrey Murphy:** Thank you Sir.

**James Mueller:** Any questions?

**Richard Schadewald:** I have one. How close are they in Fond du lac County?

**James Mueller:** Fond du Lac County the closest ones can be 1,000 feet.

**Richard Schadewald:** 1,000 feet?

**James Mueller:** 1,000 feet. For us, they are about 2,400 and it's not near far enough. We got 88 and we can see 60 some from our house. It is just unbelievable.

**Richard Schadewald:** Thank you.

**Audrey Murphy:** I think the State, ah, law at the present time though is that they can be located 1,250 feet. That's, that's the current statute that is on the book.

**James Mueller:** That is right but that it is not near far enough from a home.

**Audrey Murphy:** Alright.

**James Mueller:** Thank you.

**Audrey Murphy:** Thank you sir. Anyone else wishing to address the Board? Yes.

**Brenda Salseg:** Hello, my name is Brenda Salseg. Um, I am from the Town of Forest, St. Croix County, Wisconsin. Address is 2969 210<sup>th</sup> Avenue, Emerald, WI 54013. Forest is an agricultural and rural residential community near the Minnesota border and the metropolitan area of Minneapolis and St. Paul. I am a member of The Forest Voice; an organized group of neighbors in my community opposed to the Highland Wind Farm, which have built, will consist up to 44, 2.3 or 2.5 megawatt plus wind turbines. Highland Wind is proposed by the same developer that built Shirley Wind, Emerging Energies of Wisconsin. My community as a majority has been fighting to stop Highland Wind for over 5 years. As long as the residents of Shirley having been living with turbines. We have fought against Highland because we believe the people of Shirley and we know, without a doubt, their health issues are the result of industrial scale wind turbines. When my husband Bob and I joined the fight against Highland Wind, I needed to know what we were fighting against, if anything. To me, personal experience is the most valuable tool in finding the truth. So, in April of 2011, Bob and I traveled to Shirley at the invitation of Dave and Rose Enz to learn firsthand if we would experience, or not, any health effects in their home. Was fighting against Highland Wind the right thing to do or was the wind industry and its supporters right that all the negative reports and scare tactics were scare tactics by disgruntled neighbors not chosen to host a turbine? The afternoon was fairly windy and from inside the Enz home we could see several turbines but did not hear them. I felt normal, at first. It took about 30 minutes before I realized, what I would best describe as pressure in my ears like that one experiences when ascending or descending in an aircraft. Soon followed by what felt like a sinus pressure headache coming on. I knew, my husband knew, as he experienced some dizziness and a headache, that this was not psychosomatic or jealousy over not hosting a wind turbine. It was the physical result of being in the presence of wind turbines creating sound pressure. Um, infrasound, undisputed by the wind industry, by the way, to a level inside that home that makes a person sensitive, that makes a person whose sensitive to it physically sick. We left the Enz home and the Shirley area soon after, with the truth. Traveling through Lake Winnebago area and approaching Fond du Lac we witnessed hundreds upon hundreds of red blinking wind turbine lights from Blue Sky Green Field, Cedar Ridge and Forward Wind. The people in those communities experience health problems also know the truth. When you as a Board declared Shirley Wind a human health hazard, did you know how many thousands of people grasp that statement like a lifeline and as a beacon of hope? You made history and your courage and conviction was celebrated around the world. I plead with you now, take action to get relief for your Shirley constituents. Everywhere industrial wind turbine facilities have been

constructed in rural populated areas, the same cluster of health systems have occurred. This is not coincidence. It is fact and it is evidence. This evening, however, is about the people of Shirley who have come forward and others who are suffering in silence, those forced from their homes to restore their health. It is about the brave people like the Capelles', the Ashley's, the Enz's who came forward to help their families as well as others like us in Forest. Please fight for your constituents and restore their god given right to a good night's sleep. I know from the bottom of my heart and soul, the day is coming when the political system must acknowledge the damage being forced upon the health and safety of populations because of industrial wind turbines. Please use your power to protect and preserve the public health, to take a humanitarian stand and to lead the great state of Wisconsin in righting a wrong. We are all Badgers. We are strong and we protect our own. Thank you and God bless you.

**Audrey Murphy:** Thank you. I want to just make one comment. The Shirley, ah, Wind Project is owned by Duke Energy.

**Brenda Salseg:** That's correct. However, it was not developed and built by Duke.

**Audrey Murphy:** That is correct also. Okay. I just wanted to clarify that.

**Brenda Salseg:** Yes. It was built by the developer Emerging Energies of Wisconsin.

**Audrey Murphy:** Yes.

**Brenda Salseg:** The same developer after our community.

**Audrey Murphy:** Okay. Alright. Thank you. Alright. Anyone else wishing to address the Board?

**Joan Lagerman:** Hi. Um, thank you for listening to us. My name is Joan Lagerman. I live at W2178 County Road Q, Malone, Wisconsin, in Blue Sky Green Field. Um, I have eight within 2,000 feet. One, very, very close, under 1,000 foot to my home. I didn't have anything prepared as I just found out today that we were going to be able to speak. But what I do want to say to you here is the medications I'm now on. That I have never been on before; Lisinopril for my high blood pressure. My son was also on Lisinopril at 15 ½. His blood pressure blew. He moved out recently. Within 3 months, it's normal. He's off all medication. Doctors can't believe that it just went away. Um, Dexilant, for my stomach, my ulcers, that I have now. Zolpidem, to sleep at night; the extended relief. We tried the just regular put you to sleep but after 4 hours that would wear off and they would wake me up. Sertraline, for my nerves, for my depression. This is all what goes on when you're invaded and that's what a wind farm is—is an invasion on a community. Please take this into account. Thank you.

**Audrey Murphy:** Thank you. Yes sir.

**Robert Smurawa:** I'm Robert Smurawa. I live at 6066 County Road NN in Denmark. I am just over two miles straight east of the 6 lovely wind turbines in the Town of Glenmore. And I can tell you right now that you go out in my backyard today and you can hear them as loud as day. And, I guess ultimately we have been dealing with these things. I have had numerous

headaches, almost daily headaches. Most of time they occur in my forehead right above my eyes. I have lots of difficulty sleeping and I believe it is all caused from the wind turbines with the ultra-low frequency. I've been to my neighbor's yard, several times, helping him out and there's several occasions walking on the side of his shed, facing the turbines, I couldn't walk because all of the sudden I became dizzy where I felt like I was literally going to fall over. I had to turn back around and walk inside of his shed to get to the back side of his property to get at whatever we were going to be doing with the equipment in back. Now, I know Brown County recently just passed the ultra-low frequency noise ordinance just last, what year or two or so, to address this mainly for the wind turbines but I do know at that time there was several factories in and around the Green Bay area that were having the same issues with their neighbors and residents from the cooling fans and what not at the factories. And I do know that some of those factories did have to take action to correct the problem. I guess my concern here and my hope is with talking to you guys today that you do the same and make these people at Shirley Wind correct their problems with the ultra-low frequency. This is an ongoing problem. I know several of my neighbors have the same symptoms that I have, as far as the headaches go. So, and I would like to thank the people that came here today to tell you from other districts that we're not all just a bunch of crazy people here, disgruntled neighbors, because we're not. I know this is a big, huge undertaking for you guys to take and consider to make and take the correct actions. But look at what just a handful of determined smart people did in the Town of Glenmore. We got recognized worldwide to take and make this problems and these problems aware with people around the world. Just a handful of us people in Glenmore. And I think if we can do that with our limited resources I think you could take this and carry it even farther along with our help and our support. Thank you.

**Audrey Murphy:** Thank you very much. Yes. You have been waiting.

**Darlene Mueller:** My name is Darlene Mueller. I live at N8710 Pine Road, St. Cloud, Wisconsin. The wind turbines have totally destroyed my life style. I am a walker. I cannot walk past these turbines. I drive 7 miles away to take a walk. The flickering, the humming, vibrating that comes out of them, the airplane noises it's just nerve racking. We can't stand it, it hurts our ears. My ears feel like they are bleeding. I get up in the mornings to take a shower. There are so many spots on top of my head that I can't even hardly wash my hair because they hurt like someone has hit me in the head. I can't read. I am a reader. My kids always gave me books at Christmas time. I told them to stop because I can't concentrate. I have to re-read and re-read and re-read and I can't get through a book and the worse thing is I can't even hardly read my bible and I need to forgive the people that have done this to our community, to our families, our friends and neighbors. I need to forgive them for the pain they have caused us because our Savior Lord has forgiven me. And, I just thank you for standing up because our Fond du Lac County Board has not helped us as much as what you people have done here; and I thank you and I hope you continue this and vote for in favor to help us because it helps your county. I pray it will help our county to get onboard and help us because we need the help. Our daughter in law came over. We had an Easter egg hunt, they had to leave within an hour, she had such a terrific headache. She did not take anything for this headache but she left within an hour or two of being at our house. She got 7 miles away and she called and said Darlene I just have to tell you my headache is gone. She said, I know it came from being outside and hearing that terrific

womp, womp, womp. We can't sleep nights. We go for weeks on end not hardly getting any sleep. I have gotten up at 1-2-3 in the morning and drove to Fond du Lac to go to Walmart so I could get some peace. With no sleep. Exhausted. Totally exhausted and praying I wouldn't have an accident. So what you guys are doing hopefully will help us, so thank you.

**Audrey Murphy:** Alright. Thank you for your comments. Yes.

**Cindy Kuscienko:** My name is Cindy Kuscienko and I reside in the Town of Forest at 2953 210<sup>th</sup> Avenue, Emerald, Wisconsin 54013. Today, the decision that you render is so very important not only to the residents of Brown County but to the world. I am sure it has been a difficult task and I am thankful that each of every one of you had the courage to make the collective statement that wind turbines truly are a human health hazard. I am here to tell you what we have learned on the other side of the state. In our town, we first learned of the Shirley Project by way of a postcard that was sent to each and every member in our township. Um, we were encouraged to come and see what was going to be coming to St. Croix County. That trip never really came to fruition but we began to do the research ourselves and what impact it would have on our town. We found videos and commentaries of what it was like to live within a wind project and none of it eased our concerns. This wasn't just happening in Wisconsin, it was happening all over the globe. Proponents of wind energy only spoke of the jobs it would create and the additional monies that would be generated for the hosts, the town, and the County. They spoke of how greenhouse emissions would be reduced and how wind energy would save the world from climate change. No mention was made of just what was happening to some people living near turbines and how their lives and their health had been affected and altered. For some, the only option to protect their loved ones, was to walk away from their homes and livelihoods to find a different place to live away from turbines. Ironically, we could consider them the lucky ones. They were able to move. There are countless people that are still suffering from the effects of industrial wind turbines being sited too closely to homes. I was convinced that only, that not only were these people telling the truth, but that I do have an obligation and a duty to fighting the construction of Highland Wind in our township, and also doing what I can to assist those already impacted in Brown County, Dodge County, and all of the other wind projects throughout Wisconsin. With the hearings in regard to Highland Wind, many new people did come from all over the state to testify before the Public Service Commission about how their lives had changed. I was there to hear the heart wrenching testimonies of those whose lives have been shattered. I heard on how their health had been compromised by sleepiness due to the unnatural sounds and vibrations created by turbines. I heard how some could determine without looking out the window if the turbines were running or not by the pressure changings that was detectable to them. How children complained of headaches and only got relief when they left their homes. I heard of a woman who had to wear industrial ear protection in her home to do the things that we take for granted each and every day. Others that had to take to sleeping in basements, like you've already heard this evening, to try to escape the sounds created by industrial wind turbines. I remember being reduced to tears myself by the tearful and desperate testimony of one gentleman whose wife was, in effect, paralyzed by the low frequency noise and had to be carried back into her home by her husband. How could I not believe these people? What reason did they have to expose themselves to judgment from those who had claimed their health issues were a result of jealousy or that they weren't going

to be, um, that they were just merely annoyed. I do believe that the people who have testified before the PSC and who have probably testified before you, were and are, telling the truth. I lost my mom to cancer in 1997. You may not think that that's pertinent but they removed her lung and pronounced her cancer free. I remember that day well. We were joyous. But I also remember that my mother insisted to the doctors that the cancer was elsewhere in her body and still lurking. These were doctors who thought they knew better and dismissed my mother's insistence that cancer was still within her body. In Thanksgiving of 19... , the day after Thanksgiving in 1996 she was ambulated in and we found out she was terminal. A month before she had been pronounced cancer free. Why is my story today so important to what is happening today. It is important because of what I remember so vividly is that the oncologist, the doctor who we placed our trust in, was telling us that there was nothing that we c..., that could do, that they could to save her. He also admitted to us that he should have listened to her and insisted that more tests be done. That in hindsight, she was right. They had neglected to acknowledge her assertions that she knew her body better than they did and they may have been able to protect her, had they only listened and believed what she was telling them. They didn't. She died. I don't think any of us ever considered the health and safety issues of turbines, as we all believed that our town government or any government at all would never, ever put their relatives, friends and neighbors in harm's way. Today, you as members of the Board of Health, are given the opportunity to heed and act on what many have testified before them; that turbines, sited within close proximity to homes, are a human health hazard. I hope and pray that you stay strong and stand by that statement. Those whose lives who are in jeopardy now and in the future are counting on this Board to protect the health, safety and welfare of the residents of Brown County and of the world. Take the necessary action and put a stop to the suffering that many experience living within the footprint of an industrial wind project. Be the voice of the countless who have testified before others, whose words continue to tell of lives destroyed and of hopes that are dashed. Don't be the ones to say in hindsight, we could have, and should have, done more to protect our people. Thank you very much.

**Audrey Murphy:** Thank you for your comments.

**Richard Schadewald:** Can I ask you a question?

**Cindy Kuscienko:** Certainly.

**Richard Schadewald:** What has the public service, after hearing, did you get a response; or a quote on anything. Where are you at with your situation?

**Cindy Kuscienko:** With ours? Um, Circuit [inaudible], we took, our town board took the matter to Circuit, St. Croix Circuit Court. Judge Black did render a decision; the PSC did have the opportunity to appeal by November 27<sup>th</sup>. They chose not to. So, at this point we do not know what the actions are that they will take.

**Richard Schadewald:** What was the Circuit Court decision?

**Cindy Kuscienko:** The Circuit Court was that, um, they did not take into consideration that there were more than 6 people, and that there was, um, that they should have been.



**Audience Member 1:** The 95% rule.

**Cindy Kuscienko:** Yes the 95% rule, the 95% of the time, if the turbines were in compliance; who determined what 95% of the time was. That was the sticking point.

**Richard Schadewald:** That was the sticking point? I am asking my corporation counsel if she did. Have you heard of that case?

**Juliana Reunzel:** No. If it's a circuit court that wouldn't be statewide. It would be just within that Circuit.

**Richard Schadewald:** Within that region. And finally. Your representatives, the county, the village, the, your state representative. Where are they at?

**Cindy Kuscienko:** Our town board has and will continue to fight the construction of Highland Wind in our township. Um, we believe that our Board of Health and Human Services is taking into consideration what we've shared with them. We've made it a point to make sure that we try to educate them from what we've learned and experienced through, you know, what the words of other people.

**Mr. Schadewald:** Your state representatives. Any word?

**Cindy Kuscienko:** Our State Representative has, um, recently talked about taking some action, um, before the assembly. I'm not, I am really not sure exactly that is...

**Mr. Schadewald:** No, that's fine. Don't speak off track. I'm just trying.....

**Cindy Kuscienko:** but we do have people that are in our court and do believe that.

**Mr. Schadewald:** Okay. Thanks.

**Cindy Kuscienko:** Thank you.

**Audrey Murphy:** Any other questions for her? Alright. Thank you. Yes. Bill.

**William Acker:** Good evening. My name is William Acker. I live at 3217 Nicolet Drive. I am a consulting engineer that's been working on the issue of illnesses from low frequency noise and infrasound coming from cooling towers and industrial wind turbines. I was asked by my city alderman to get involved over 8 years ago and I've continued that research all these years without accepting any compensation for my work. I would like to speak to you tonight about the progress that has been made on this issue over the past 8 years as it relates to utility sized industrial wind turbines. First of all, NASA was involved in the development of wind turbines for generation of electricity starting in 1975 and ending in 1996. They were developing wind turbines for use way before, ah, there was a market for wind turbines to make electricity. Ah, that market started around 1985. NASA quickly became aware of annoyance problems from experimental wind turbines they built, way before the wind turbine market started. NASA worked on .1 megawatt units, .2, 2 megawatt, 2.5 megawatt, 4 megawatt. So, they built all those units and experienced annoyance with those wind turbines. Also, a 7.3 megawatt, but

that was never constructed. In the 1980's, Dr. Neil Kelly with NASA and his colleagues wrote about the wind turbine energy pulses and the noise in infrasound and low frequency bands which resonated inside resident's living structures directly causing symptoms described as annoyance. Once the wind turbine industry began, around 1985, people from around the world started to complain about health problems and lack of sleep. However, at these sites the wind turbine project owners refused to participate in any noise test conducted by professional acoustical engineers. These owners have refused to start and stop the wind turbines on windy days and have refused to provide wind turbine performance data. To help the acousticians understand the impact on the environment, until recently, two projects, over the last few years, were tested with the assistance of wind turbine owners. One project is Falmouth, Massachusetts and the other is Cape Bridgewater in Australia. The Falmouth installation was owned by the town and the town wanted answers to the annoyance being claimed by the residents, so they allowed testing on their wind turbines and they allowed, ah, performance data to be provided to the acousticians and this data shows, not just at this site, but also at the Australian site, that there are significant levels of amplitude modulated noise from wind turbines which disappeared when the wind turbines were shut, excuse me, shut off. The Cape Bridgewater study was unique because it included health evaluations of the residents living near the wind turbines which clearly showed that the annoyance went up when the wind turbine speeds increased and when the wind turbine output increased. We have also seen the wind testing done at Shirley Wind instituted by the Wisconsin Public Service Commission in an effort to get answers for our state. That study says the four investigating firms are of the opinion that enough evidence and a hypothesis has been given herein to classify LFN and infrasound as a serious issue possibly affecting the future of the industry. I would like you to know that we are not anti-wind turbine or anti-renewable electricity people. Many of the people that work with me support renewable electricity. At the Shirley Wind Project site we have over 80 people claiming illnesses and I have met with many of these people and have participated in testing in a number of these homes. We have found very significant pressure pulsations at this site, at Falmouth and Cambridge, Cape Bridgewater. The pressure pulsations from peak to trough have been as high as 5 dB. It is my belief that if we write a noise code limiting the amplitude modulation of this noise to 3 dB, which by the way has been adopted by certain European countries, that these problems would be eliminated. Of course, the wind turbine industry has not come up with a wind turbine to solve this problem yet, so in order to meet the 3 dB criteria they are probably going to be pushed, in my opinion, perhaps, 4-6 miles away from residents. You should also know that the health problems are supported by very prominent people like Professor Alec Salt with the Department of Otolaryngology at Washington University School of Medicine in St. Louis. He believes that if the inner ear is exposed to infrasound and low frequency noise long enough it can develop into an imbalance in the fluid levels and pressure leading to endocochlear hydrops. You should also know that University studies on car sickness show that car sickness is caused by infra and low frequency noise, pressure pulsations through an open car window. So, if you would like to experience for yourself, what these people are experiencing, I would do what this study tells you to do. Get your car up on the highway, open the back windows but keep the front windows open and turn your ventilation to full blast. I guarantee you that you will experience pressure pulsations that you've never experienced before and that will be followed by nausea. And last of all, we have a mink farm in

Denmark that was exposed to 3 megawatt wind turbines which immediately caused the mink to start biting each other. Some of them died from these bites and then within one month of operation they had 1,600 miscarriages. This has never happened before. They had to eventually shut the mink farm down because they were just simply losing too many mink. This isn't some kind of indication but, you know, if you think about it, if it can affect the birth of mink, what is it going to do to the unborn child? We also have universities studying the possibility of lung damage from exposure. I really hope that you guys make the right decision tonight and if you don't, those of us that are working on this issue will continue the battle. I have no doubt that eventually someone like Professor Alec Salt or whatever will get the final slam dunk medical proof that we want. Ah, I think we have enough to win a court case now but, you know, we all would like to have that really solid medical evidence that will make us get through court very easily. Thank you very much for hearing me tonight.

**Audrey Murphy:** Thank you.

**Richard Schadewald:** Can we ask some questions?

**Audrey Murphy:** Sure.

**Richard Schadewald:** Um, several. First, writing an ordinance, what is it 3 dB?

**William Acker:** Yes.

**Richard Schadewald:** Okay. Is that by who, by the County?

**William Acker:** Yes.

**Richard Schadewald:** Okay. That is what you are looking for the County, right?

**William Acker:** Right.

**Richard Schadewald:** Now earlier somebody mentioned there was an ordinance. Was that? We didn't?

**William Acker:** There are some ordinances like that in Europe. Ah, one in particular that I read...

**Richard Schadewald:** No I mean is there one now? A gentleman mentioned that we did write an ordinance.

**William Acker:** To my knowledge there is no ordinance for infrasound or low frequency noise in the United States yet.

**Richard Schadewald:** Yet. Okay. Because that is what I was wondering because I heard it before. Is there like a noise ordinance from those heating cooling.

**William Acker:** Cooling towers that were tested produced the same pressure pulsations, ah, that we got at the Enz home when we tested, ah, those two locations and so both locations had this significant peak to peak pressure pulsation and in my discussions with Richard, Acoustical

Engineer, Richard James, that had worked with this on this issue; he has no doubt that the problems are related to these pressure pulsations.

**Richard Schadewald:** He was the next thing I was going to bring up. I remember a year ago that he was working on an ordinance.

**William Acker:** Yes.

**Richard Schadewald:** Has he finished it?

**William Acker:** Um, to my knowledge, he hasn't been given direction to go ahead and write that ordinance. But I'm thoroughly convinced that he's got enough information that the ordinance could be written today if he was given the okay by Brown County to go ahead and do that. And my suggestion is that we do that because I do believe that he's got enough. That is not to say that as we learn more that we can make adjustments to that.

**Richard Schadewald:** Absolutely.

**William Acker:** But there are so many European countries that have already done this. I really think the time is now to do this. The problem is not just with wind turbines. We've got a cooling tower in downtown Green Bay that's doing the same thing; we've got a boiler in Stevens Point that is doing the same thing. Ah, with my research there is no doubt that this problem is all related to this modulated sound and so the peak to trough that we are seeing is occurring like within a second to two seconds and that is what we are focusing on is to write that noise code for those intermittent pressure pulsations that we are seeing that we believe are causing the problems.

**Richard Schadewald:** And then my final question was you mentioned if there was no definite study yet for the medical.

**William Acker:** I would say that there are no slam dunk studies but the study that I like to cite is by Professor Alec Salt that has conducted studies on animals; and what he did is he opened the brain of the animal, put sensors on the brain, exposed them to wind turbine noise. He found that they got very irritated from that exposure, and that was guinea pigs by the way, and then after that test, he did a post mortem autopsy of the inner ear canal, and he found damage to the hair cells. Now this type of testing can't be done on humans; that is why this is so difficult to come up with a procedure to prove this. So even car sickness hasn't been proven. Even though the auto industry accepted that it was a real thing, we have studies by them where they modified the cars to try to reduce the impact of pressure pulsations related to, ah, air flowing through open windows in a car. So, to me all the evidence is there that this is pressure pulsations. The only question is if you are taking this into a court of law, how strong does your case have to be to prove the medical link. If we could open a person's brain and do that same type of testing that Alec Salt did on guinea pigs, we'd have it. He thinks he can conduct the necessary type of studies to get that slam dunk experience but he said that is such intrigue testing, what he told me, that it would take probably 2-3 years to do it and the budget for doing something like that, he said he's just not able to get that kind of money to carry out that type of study. So, we're hoping that other universities, like Germany, who has been studying the

situation and others maybe eventually, get that slam dunk thing for us. But otherwise, I think there is enough evidence right now that I think we could win in a court of law. We got lots of good testing data to show what's happening.

**Mr. Schadewald:** Okay. Thanks.

**Audrey Murphy:** Anything else?

**Richard Schadewald:** Dr. Tibbetts.

**Jay Tibbetts:** Well, in answer to the question there. The Portuguese study, with the, and we all had access to that, the family that was exposed and the son and the mother moved out. Now the son was doing poorly in school. They did evoked potentials at that time and, ah, they were poor and then he moved out and they did the evoked potentials again and his, ah, achievement level improved and his evoked potentials were significantly better. So there are.....If you talk about that as an association or causation, I think I wanted to just add to Bill, there are a number of observations, you know, in and out of the wind farm and of course if you looked at something called Koch's Postulates which, ah, in a liberal sense is you get sick and, ah, in the wind farm-- you go away, you're well or getting better and then you go back on the wind farm and you are sick again. I mean, you know, these are common sense things that unfortunately are true and they're hard to dismiss.

**Richard Schadewald:** No, I firmly believe everybody in fact I even know what he is talking about with the car ride. I get that, in my ears. Did we, cause I wasn't in, did Rick James talk to you guys about an ordinance.

**Audrey Murphy:** Yes. Yes.

**Jay Tibbetts:** The issue with Rick James is, ah, the County Board, ah, two or three years, at least two, ah, allocated \$4,000, ah, for a study, ah, to, ah, develop an amendment to the our present noise code to include ILFN and, ah, he, as Bill said, he has all the data. Ah, I think that he has just has not gotten around to putting this together. He's not to my knowledge, he hasn't billed us at all.

**Audrey Murphy:** No. Uh-uh.

**Jay Tibbetts:** And so it's still, it's in process.

**Richard Schadewald:** I will find out where we are.

**Jay Tibbetts:** And again, the, the idea with, with that would be complaint driven so if a business was, ah, out of, was, ah, not in compliance but nobody complained, no problem.

**Richard Schadewald:** Right. Okay.

**Audrey Murphy:** Alright. Is there anyone else wishing to address the Board? Yes. Susan.

**Susan Ashley:** My name is Susan Ashley, 309 Prospect Avenue, Denmark. I want to talk about what has compelled me to stand here today. About 5 years ago, as you know Shirley

Wind began erecting a nearly 500 foot tall turbines in Glenmore, Wisconsin. Since that time some people living, working and visiting the area have noticed negative effects to their health and well-being. My family lived a little over a mile away from the closest turbine. After the turbines became operational, we experienced symptoms that were either rarely or never experienced before by us; symptoms such as ear pressure and pain, intense headaches, sleeplessness, anxiety and over all malaise to mention a few. This was as so unusual for us as we are very healthy family. It took a while for us to realize that these ill effects were associated with the turbines. But when we went away from the area, we felt better and when we returned to our home, the adverse symptoms also returned. As many of you know, we left our home to find relief. Here's what I know. Three families in Glenmore left their homes due to ill effects associated with the Shirley Wind Farm. More families say they would leave if they were able to or could find a way to do so. At least 23 families have written documentation regarding health effects they believed are linked to the Shirley Wind Farm. Many have stated that when they are away from the wind farm, their adverse health symptoms lessen or disappear, but when they return to the area and the turbines are spinning, the negative symptoms also return. Some residents tried to stay away as long as possible from their homes just to find relief. At this point at least 83 people have reported that they experienced negative health effects while residing, working or visiting the vicinity of the Shirley Wind Farm. These numbers represent written documents. I know of other oral complaints that are not added to these numbers. Because of the complaints that began circulating after Shirley Wind became operational, some people began researching this phenomenon and realized our issues were not isolated. We learned that other people in other areas and even other continents were experiencing these same negative impacts that they associated with the wind farms in their area. When I read and listened to the story of people I didn't know and who didn't even know me, I realized how very familiar their story was to ours. It became shockingly clear. We were not alone with our problems. We are victims with the same plight. A request was even sent to Duke, owner of Shirley Wind. Excerpts from the letter to Duke Energies states, "if you, that being Duke Energy, are confident that your operation is not responsible for our hardships or symptoms, we would like a written statement from your company medical doctor or other medical professionals who can qualify that conclusion. If we decide to rent or sell our valued homes we would like to have your signed written statement to give to potential renters or buyers that they are not putting themselves in harm's way due to living in the vicinity of your wind farm." This request was made a few times. Duke Energy was given the opportunity to give us a definitive conclusion that their wind farm was safe for the people living in the vicinity of their operation. We are still waiting for this statement. Duke Energy has not given it to us. Due to the issues that developed in Glenmore after Shirley Wind arrived, studies and testing by acoustical engineer Richard James were performed. The Shirley study was also performed by independent acoustical experts. These studies have found infrasound inside of homes that have been vacated; some at the distance of over a mile from the nearest wind turbine. The cooperative measurement survey concluded that infrasound was a serious issue. Infrasound has been linked to wind turbines. Infrasound has been associated to negative health effects by many research experts. Due to the reported symptoms and the actual Glenmore study conclusions, a request was made to the Brown County Board of Health, to you. The Board of Health motto is to prevent, promote and to

protect. We need protection. According to the Wis. Stats. 251.04 under Local board of health; powers and duties.

*(7) A local board of health shall assure that measures are taken to provide an environment in which individuals can be healthy."*

A review of local ordinances already in place to protect the public safety and health in general welfare can be found in the Brown County Code of Ordinance under **38.01(b) Public Health Nuisance**. This ordinance says.

*(b) Human Health Hazard. "Human health hazard" means a substance, activity or condition that is known to have the potential to cause acute or chronic illness or death if exposure to the substance, activity or condition is not abated."*

It is due to these statutes along with the studies and documentation of the citizens of Brown County that on October 14, 2014, a human health hazard declaration was made by you. Although this declaration validated the evidence given to the Board, more action needs to take place. I know these things can take time but how much time. For many it's been 5 years of ill effects on their health and well-being. Five years is a long time for people of Brown County to suffer. I pray a solution to the end of this suffering will come soon. Thank you for listening.

**Audrey Murphy:** Thank you for your comments. Anyone else wishing to address the Board? Yes. Do you want to? Go ahead.

**Jean Tenor:** My name is Jean Tenor. I live at 3290 School Road, in Glenmore. I am less than a ½ mile away from two industrial turbines. I want the Board to know that I am not crazy and I am not an old woman. This problem is affecting three generations of my family. My husband and I cannot sleep at night. I am on an anti-anxiety med and sleeping pill and if we can get three hours of sleep a night, it's a good night. I have two sons that live at home, 55 and 54. Neither one of them can sleep either. They refuse to go on medication. They're both hard working individuals and are tired all the time. And last, I wasn't going to speak, but last Saturday we did the family tradition of going to cut the Christmas tree with my 14 year old grandson. And we cut the tree and we came home and he always puts the lights on and helps grandma decorate. Well, we didn't get finished. So I said to him, "Kyle, do you want to stay overnight and we will finish tomorrow?" And he said to me "Grandma, I am not staying overnight by your house." And I said "Honey, why won't you stay overnight?" And this is the first time he mentioned it to me but he said "Grandma, I can't sleep by your house so I am not going to stay over anymore." And this is the same grandson that I babysat full time for 7 years; which is approximately the time, 7 years ago, when Shirley Wind started. So now, I have three generations of my family that cannot sleep by my house. The Board of Health has declared Shirley Wind turbines a health hazard. I would leave Glenmore but who is going to buy my house and move into an area that's a health hazard. So I am forced to stay there. I am fighting cancer. I go away. I was up north for 10 days, 11 days deer hunting. I came home and my tumor markers dropped 13 points. So, I believe it is all related to the turbines. Can I prove it? No. If I go up north by my travel trailer and I stay for a week to 10 days, I can sleep but it takes at least 2 to 3 nights before your system re-adjusts and you can go back to sleep. So, they say, well, how do you sleep when the turbines are off? You can't tell them one night. You have to have them. If they are going to do any studies they have to shut them off for more than one or two nights. Thank you.

**Audrey Murphy:** Thank you for your comments. And there was someone else? I can't see her from here.

**Mary Nelesen:** Hi. I am Mary Nelesen. I am actually from Calumet County from Calumet County Citizens for Responsible Energy. My address is W3095 Hickory Hills Road, in Chilton, Wisconsin. And I would like to thank all of you people for taking this issue under your consideration. I actually have an airport across the street from my home, so, I mean, I am actually, ah, along with these people. I just want to tell you that, like, about 9 or 10 years ago, ah, Calumet County Citizens for Responsible Energy took, hired two coach buses. We went to the State of Wisconsin and the same stories that you're hearing today I heard like 9 or 10 years ago. And I think that this is so sad and I just want to tell you people that thank you for having, you know, even thinking about considering this. Now, in Calumet County 10 years ago all of the sudden my neighbor called up and said, "Oh I saw something on TV. I think it is our neighborhood." Okay. So, we went to the Calumet County Board, you know, like a meeting like this. Well, the wind company was there. They were actually proposing a wind farm in our area. And what the wind companies do is they'll go to one farmer and they'll say "you might as well sign up for a wind turbine because your neighbor signed up already and you're going to have it there, so you might as well put one up and you might as well try to get the money too." And so it is really, I mean, I don't know how to, how to explain this but our group has been working on this for 10 years. We have been, we have fund raisers. We have a lobbyist. And, I feel really bad that, I mean, I could have, I had people, we had a meeting at our place just on Monday night and we have, we still have an active group. We do fundraisers and we try to, you know, get our point across. But what I'd like to tell you is the Realtors Association at the state level. The towns association at the state level are all in tune with all the these people that you have heard and so I really think that, you know, for you people to vote and to decide, actually I feel bad that from Calumet County tonight that I am the only one here. My husband said, "Don't get up and talk. Don't get up and talk." I said, "I have to get up and talk" because, like, 9 or 10 years ago when we started this whole thing; now I am hearing the same thing 10 years later and these poor people, you know, are just in, I mean I feel so bad for them. And, I mean, I don't have to actually worry about it because I have an airport across the street from me, and they're not going to be able to put up an airport. I want to tell you that our group did research. Flight for life, if you are a farmer and if you have an accident out in your field, flight for life cannot land. I mean, we have, our group really has done a lot of research and I feel really bad that I couldn't give you all of the information that we did. But I tell you what, if there's a farmer in this room that has a farm accident out on his land and if he wants flight for life to land to try to save his life, flight for life cannot land within a certain area. And, I am sure you people know this because you are on the Calumet County Board or Brown County Board of Health. And, I guess I feel really bad. I didn't realize that, you know, other people from other counties could come and talk to you people tonight, because like I said, 9-10 years ago we had two busloads go down there. And there were people, there were two hours, two hours of people coming up and everyone, every story is the same. So, I guess, I just, you know, just thank you for, you know, doing what you are doing and hopefully these people and the people in our area and all over. This is all over the country. We had about, I don't know, maybe, about 8 years ago, um, we had people that were flown in to Chilton and we had a meeting at an auditorium. These were people that came from North Carolina and New York. We flew them in. And those people had wind turbines that were close to them and they had the same stories these people have. So, I mean, it, it really, and you know, like people that live in the city say "Oh well, wind is so great." It, you know, I mean it's really, but you know what happens, wind is great. People in the city don't realize the effects when that wind turbine is gonna to be close to their property line because if you're in the city you have a house there. You don't have a wind turbine. And I mean, I guess, it's just, I mean, it's just really sad. That, I mean, I feel so bad for all these people that are living



under these conditions because it really isn't good. And actually in Fond du Lac, I mean, I don't know this for a fact, but I think someone said "Well their electric bill went up." Well, if their electric bill went up and they have wind turbines, why would their electric bill go up? Wouldn't you think their electric bill would go down? You know, so, I don't know, I guess, maybe I shouldn't have spoke because I am not from Brown County but I just really wanted to thank all of you people for even having this meeting and letting these people listen. Okay. Thank you very much.

**Richard Schadewald:** I just have a question Miss.

**Mary Nelesen:** Yes.

**Richard Schadewald:** You know a lobbyist?

**Mary Nelesen:** Mn-hmm.

**Richard Schadewald:** A registered lobbyist?

**Mary Nelesen:** Yes.

**Richard Schadewald:** With the state of Wisconsin?

**Mary Nelesen:** Mn-hmm.

**Richard Schadewald:** And it comes through your...

**Mary Nelesen:** Calumet County Citizens for Responsible Energy.

**Richard Schadewald:** Calumet County Citizens for Responsible Energy. Okay.

**Mary Nelesen:** And I feel bad that, you know, maybe, I guess what happened, ah, actually there was a lawsuit and I don't know the details about the lawsuit. But I know that one of the men that was in our group was on that lawsuit, and it was the realtors association and it was the towns association. And I know that years ago we hired a group because people will say what happens is the wind company comes in and says your value of your property is going to go up if you get a wind turbine next to you. Well, we actually did a study. We had to pay, like, I think we had to pay like, oh, about \$15,000 for this study. Our group did and it was conclusive. This group did this study and they, they came right out and said that your property value isn't going to go up like these people are saying. They can't sell their homes. And I mean, I think if you try, if you, you see different homes, I mean, even our banker. Well, we had an incident in, in our area and my husband was in, in talking with the bank and he said "This is really sad." There was a man who owned a home close to a wind turbine and he wanted to refinance his home and the banker said, "I couldn't refinance his home because he had a wind turbine next to him." He had to come up with more money so that he could actually ref. He couldn't even refinance his home. So, these poor people can't sell their homes; and they can't even probably refinance them because these wind turbines are so terrible. So, anyway, but thank you for listening to me; and I hope I didn't talk too long. Thank you very much.

**Audrey Murphy:** Is there anyone else present that wishes to address the Board because, ah, this is going to be your last opportunity. Yes. You next. Back there. You'll be next.

**Sandy Johnson:** Um, I wasn't going to speak tonight either. I didn't realize we had that opportunity. My name is Sandra Johnson. I live at 1893 Wayside Road, Greenleaf, Wisconsin in the Town of Holland in southern Brown County. And I want you to think of it this way, you folks, I really appreciate the fact that you're taking this time, you've, you've really been patient, you've tried to glean through the misinformation to locate the truth on this and, um, like I said, others have said, these people are not lying. My husband, Carl, and I are retired teachers. Dave Enz called us. I'd never met Dave. We had some of the same symptoms. I was there 45 minutes, ah, got so, at his farm that has been, not abandoned, but, um, that he's moved away from. He still owes that farm. And within 45 minutes I was so nauseated I had to go home. Carl had dizziness, wooziness, had trouble standing. But I want you think about Shirley Wind. I want you to imagine, um, kind of an analogy here. It is like 8 - 18 wheeler trucks have flipped over in the Town of Glenmore. They're leaking and oozing toxic materials into the soil and into the water and into the water table. What happens? The DNR is called immediately. They do, ah, questioning. They, they do testing. They set up barriers so that the stuff oozing out of those trucks doesn't get into the East River or any stream or even in the ground water. The sheriff is called right away. Trucks and lights are flashing everywhere. All the authorities are called including Brown County, probably Brown County Board of Health within a day or so. But almost immediately the cleanup begins. Why? Because they know that there's big, big trouble if that stuff doesn't get cleaned up and isn't stopped from oozing out of those 8 semi-trucks. The DNR, I have a, um, family member that works for the State DNR in water quality. And you know, you'll, you'll have, maybe, a manure spill and they're called and they've got to make sure, ah, to get to the bottom of why the manure reached the neighbors wells. Their, if the problem is the, um, farm that did the spreading of the manure, maybe in bad conditions, frozen land, snow, which they shouldn't have done, they'll get cited and pay a fine. The DNR, ah, in terms of the the spilled, ah, toxins from the 18 wheelers will go in and they would ask questions; was the driver speeding; um, was there a mechanical error; did he blow a tire, whatever it was. And likely the company hauling this stuff would be fined and possibly, um, taken to court. Now to date, we have 80 plus people, and I heard there are 5 more people that are afraid to speak up. So, we potentially could have 85 residents of the Shirley Wind Project. They either live there and work there, or they just work there and they are having problems being there for 8 hours. But to date, people are listening but nothing's happening. You have infants, you have toddlers, you have elderly people, being exposed to these byproducts of electrical generation. The byproducts aren't just infrasound and low frequency noise. Everybody here living in the dairy state knows about stray voltage. Stray voltage can put a farmer out of business. Bud Gerrits filed one of the first lawsuits against the utility because of the stray voltage that he had measured by a professional in his farm. He won over a million dollar settlement. This is years ago. But it, the news of that spread fast, and other farmers realized "Gee, my milk production is down; it didn't used to be this way." They would get testing in there and they would file a suit. So, stray voltage though is also a byproduct of electrical generation of these towers. It's been measured in these homes. Many, many times what's considered safe measured at their faucet of their sink in their kitchen. Some of those people cried when they heard the result. Electromagnetic fields are created any time you have an electrical line. I took a class and you can consider your thumb like the wire and your fingers going around that wire. Your thumb is the electrical wire, the current and the electromagnetic field wraps around that wire. These turbines and high, high tension power lines create electromagnetic fields. The guys at the top of the utilities won't tell you not to build near high tension power lines but they know better because if you go to the website for the American Cancer Society, they talk about how homes that are too close to high tension power lines, they have a high incidence of childhood leukemia. It's on the website. I read it within days of hearing that Invenergy wanted to come into our southern part of the state. And then another byproduct talked about tonight; infrasound and low frequency noise. Here is the deal folks; you can measure it. A micro barometer. You can buy a

micro barometer for about \$200 and you can hook it up to your computer and you can measure ILFN to see if it's present in that home. It's measureable and you know and we all know that there are homes that have had micro barometers in them, not just in Brown County and they've measured ILFN. Bill Acker made a reference to Dr. Salt's work; the damage to the inner ear; it explains the nausea, it explains headaches, it explains problems with balance. It can explain tinnitus. About 6 years ago, I called a gentleman from Canada, and I can't remember Dave's last name, David Collings. Was it Collings?

**Carl Johnson:** Colling.

**Sandra Johnson:** Colling. I am sorry. I talked to him on the phone. He died in an electric accident on a farm trying to test for IFLN with an electrical, um, accident. But he gave me the name of Tom Tanton. Tom Tanton is an acoustic engineer from California. He was on the Energy Board for the State of California for 35 years and I called him and I said, "Invenergy wants to come in put up 100 turbines. We are not hearing good things, what can you tell me?" He said, "It's a boondoggle." He said, "We have thousands of wind turbines in California that are broken down. What do they do, they leave. They abandon them because it costs them too much; it affects their bottom line if they have to repair them." But then, maybe a year later he sent me a document and what it is it lists the states that consider the producer of electricity liable for any byproducts from their electrical generation. It is on the books in the State of Wisconsin. And that supported, um, I didn't come with the number of that law, the, the. But any event, Wisconsin's on that list. There are about 15 states where these private companies that are producing electricity that if there are a byproduct coming off and are harming people, their liable. That's what we have here. They're liable for this. So, back to the trucks. So, what we have is we have the truck still spewing toxins, still harming people, still oozing into the water. The only difference is the turbines are affecting the homes and the air and people's health and all there is to fight this certainly is the science so far but free speech and people like you willing to look at the evidence and do something about it. Thank you very much.

**Audrey Murphy:** Thank you for that comment. There was a gentlemen back there that wished to, ah, be heard. Then I think we should wrap this up.

**Glen Schwalbach:** Hello. I am Glen Schwalbach. And, um, I haven't been involved in these proceedings and previous hearings or whatever but, I am a licensed professional engineer for the State of Wisconsin, um, in the State of Wisconsin. I spent over 40 years trying to make the delivery of energy as safe as possible; ah, namely natural gas and, and somewhat electricity. After I retired I became aware of the safety and health issues with the wind turbines so I decided to get involved and that was about 7 years ago. I helped some of the towns, um, create their ordinances, ah, before we had PSC 135. Um, one of the 6, I am one of 6 members, ah, on the Wind Siting Council for Public Service Commission of Wisconsin who are looking at focusing on health and safety issues. The other 8, ah, more or less have direct or indirect financial interest in wind energy so we're called the minority but we're almost, almost half. Um, what an engineer has to do is look at the science and try to interpret it and decide, you know, what's illegitimate, what's logical, what's reasonable and then apply it to our everyday lives. I am convinced that infrasound and low frequency noise indeed is affects people. There's clinical tests that show the negative responses, nothing to do with wind turbines in those studies; just looking at what infrasound does. Um, one study, ah, they subjected the eye ball for instance to, ah, low frequency noise, actually infrasound and, ah, found that, ah, there was blurred vision, there was reporting of ghosts. It's kind of interesting that, ah, haunted houses, ah, those attractions that are there, some permanent, actually know about low frequency noise. They introduced it in their, um, their attractions to make people feel eerie in the process. Ah, some structures that

have been considered haunted, they have gone in and found the presence of infrasound and low frequency noise. It could be from an old fan that's still running in the warehouse or whatever. Foreign countries know about this. The ones that have the most, ah, wind, the most experience with wind generally have restrictions on infrasound and low frequency noise. When, ah, Denmark announced that they were going to put regulations in place, Vestas, a large wind turbine manufacturer objected that the regs would affect their machines and the, and the production, electric production from them. Um, it basically acknowledged, yeah, wind turbines produce infrasound low frequency noise. It's been established, ah, that the, ah, larger ones produce more and in the Shirley Wind Farm you have the largest, ah, some of the largest, um, one of the largest, let's say in the, in the country at 495 feet. Um, I am trying to give you things that maybe were not talked about before, for, for, um, instance, Wisconsin Public, a few years ago had to pay to relocate a neighbor that was being affected by low frequency noise from a gas turbine generator. Um, they also verified more recently that a resident who lived almost two miles away from, ah, the Weston Coal Plant near Wausau, ah, was impacted by low frequency noise and they indicated at that time, I assume they have done it by now; but they indicated they would modify the air handling equipment at the plant and to eliminate that. They actually hired a consultant that verified the signature was the same at the plant as it was at the home, again almost two miles away. One study has shown a strong correlation and some have alluded to it, that people who suffer from motion sickness are likely to suffer from infrasound and low frequency noise impacts. I understand that Duke was willing to finance a stray voltage study but would not shut down for, ah, for the four consultants who were doing the infrasound study in the Shirley Wind Farm. Since the stray voltage study would have cost them a lot more than shutting down for an hour or two, um, to do the infrasound study, um, I wonder what that means. Um, they may be pretty confident they don't have a serious issue with stray voltage but and maybe know they got an issue with infrasound. I will let you be the judge of that. I agree that Richard James would be an excellent choice to help Brown County draft an ordinance. But you have to continue to address the issue today of Shirley Wind Farm's impact. There is no reason to sympathize with Duke Energy. They should have done the proper due diligence. I know that the problems with infrasound and low infrequency noise was known in the industry, their industry. It was known that the larger turbines cause more infrasound low frequency noise. Shirley Wind Farm, um, is one of the largest. They should have known that it could be more substantial as far as the impact. Um, from what I can tell from their website, they own over 500 wind turbines around the country and just 8 of them are in Glenmore. Um, it's hardly a blip on their, ah, balance sheet. And I think that's what I got to say.

**Audrey Murphy:** Alright.

**Glen Schwalbach:** I made notes as we went. I didn't know we could testify tonight either.

**Richard Schadewald:** Can I ask some questions Madam Chairman?

**Audrey Murphy:** Of course.

**Richard Schadewald:** Go back to your notes, where did the people get or do you know how they got the utilities to help fix it, ah, you said somebody got Wisconsin Public Service to do this or somebody got somebody to do that. How did that happen? Was that a lawsuit? A civil lawsuit? What was it?

**Glen Schwalbach:** In both cases as far as I know it was complaints from the individual and the company followed up on it. Um, I am not sure if they had a consultant come in for the, the West Marinette turbine but they did for the Weston Plant. And, um, I think in the case of the

turbine, gas turbine, they, um, they bought the house basically and I understand helped the people move it, um, so they could still live in their same home somewhere else.

**Richard Schadewald:** Okay. Ah, and then you're part of the minority in Wisconsin Public Service Commission?

**Glen Schwalbach:** Part of the minority on the, We have 14 active members on the Wind Siting Council.

**Richard Schadewald:** Wind Siting Council.

**Glen Schwalbach:** There are 6, there is 6 of us that, um, yeah created the minority report.

**Richard Schadewald:** Right, Right, and, um, since you are here tonight, you know, ah, besides the ordinance do you see any other actions that the County Board can do.

**Glen Schwalbach:** Um, there's, there's, so many problems, you know, shutting them down isn't the answer. Um, there might, there might be the possibility of having, giving them, Duke a chance to show that they're not a problem. They should finance it but you folks choose who will be the consultants to make those determinations. Um, it might be a reasonable approach. Um, so it's you shut down or you prove to us within a year or whatever, you know, that we can ah that you are not a problem.

**Richard Schadewald:** And that would be a study?

**Glen Schwalbach:** It would be more studies, independent consultants, chosen by an unbiased panel like yourselves.

**Richard Schadewald:** Okay. Thank you.

**Glen Schwalbach:** And Richard James could be a very useful, perhaps reviewer of that.

**Richard Schadewald:** Okay.

**Audrey Murphy:** Thank you very much for your comments. Alright this is going to be your last chance, going, going, gone. Yes. But we need to, yes, come and.

**Jamie Fletcher:** I'll make it short.

**Audrey Murphy:** Alright. Please do. I don't mean to cut anyone off but time is becoming a factor.

**Jamie Fletcher.** My name is Jamie Fletcher. I live at 6215 County Road W, Greenleaf, WI, ah, near the Shirley Wind project. I am about a mile and a half away from the closest turbine. Since these things have gone up it has been absolute hell out there. We have people living in their basements now. Would any of you like to live in your basement? I have been sick. I have been struggling with bacterial infections, candida infections, anxiety, stress, headaches, my mother and myself. I had abnormal cells in my endometrium three years ago and two years ago and then I had to stop the fight because it was too much. I can't go for a walk and feel normal. Your life is completely changed. This needs to stop. These need to be shut down. If you go online on YouTube, there's Shirley Wind updates; little videos of people who have been

suffering the same things. They're not here because they have given up; because nobody has helped. Gone to various boards, the town board, we have all driven down to Madison, we've testified. We have pleaded and begged with our State leaders, with our national leaders and nothing gets done because it's all this, this thing about money, and national leaders won't do anything because it's about the budget. Well, we need renewable energy. We need this and that. Well, it's all subsidized and its subsidized 100% by our tax money. And then nobody wants to fight them because they're afraid of lawsuits. Nobody wants to get sued because it's too big of a machine to fight. But it's all our tax money that is going into subsidizing these. And it's to the point now where we are just collateral damage and that is all we feel like. Because a few have to suffer for the many and we're sick of that but nobody cares. And it's your job as the Board of Health to do something about it because you not only have people who are suffering, you have people who are dying now. And if you do not choose life, this is going to continue. This is going to continue in the Town of Forest, this is going to continue in Mishicot, in Manitowoc, in Tish Mills, in that area and when that wind turbine farm goes up it's going to be affecting kids because it is going up right next to a school. And it's going to keep going. You have the opportunity to stop this right now. So, we ask that you please choose life and not money and do something.

**Audrey Murphy:** Thank you.

**Jamie Fletcher:** Thank you.

**Audrey Murphy:** Alright. Ah. I think the Board has heard from everyone that wishes to be heard. This will be your last opportunity because then we are going to close this portion of the agenda called public comments and we're going to move on. The second item on our agenda this evening is the decision of Health Department Director. And perhaps I should explain this to the group. Statutorily, the Board of Health had the ability to do what it did. We used a Brown County Ordinance which was referenced already this evening, and it's, um, Chapter 38.01, and then we used a State Statute, which is 251.04(7). And this is what we based our decision on. However, the Director of the Health Department wears really three hats. She's the Director of the Health Department; she is the Health Officer; and also she's the enforcement person according the state statute. So, we did what we believed in and now you are going to hear from her. So, I, I wanted that explained to you. The other comment that I would make is that through this entire process, which has been about 5 years, we have focused only on health. We just stayed focused on that one issue. We didn't get involved in the economics and all that other, um, stuff, so to speak. We just focused on health and we studied this as I said for about 5 years.

**2. Which is the Decision of the Health Department Director on the procedure going forward regarding the Shirley Wind Farm matter after extensive review of all materials received from both sides.**

**Audrey Murphy:** So now we are on number 2; which is the Decision of the Health Department Director on the procedure going forward regarding the Shirley Wind Farm matter after extensive review of all materials received from both sides; and Chua.

Before Chua begins, I want to just make one other comment, I'm, indulge me for one minute. In this, um, Wind Siting Council Report which is done, which is a mandate and, and its done, the PSC mandates this and so they select a, ah, council of people and it's made up of 15 people. On page 1 of this report, I just want to quote from here because when I said to you just recently that we focused only on health.

*As required by Wis. Stat. § 15.797(1)(b), the Commission appoints a Council of 15 members representing stakeholder categories with interests in or related to wind projects. One member, one member is to have expertise on health impacts attributed to wind energy systems and be a member of the UW-system. This seat is currently vacant.”*

So in this report there was no medical person involved in it and I think that's quite telling. Thank you. Chua, you're on.

**Chua Xiong:** Um, Good evening. Can everyone hear me? Um, Good evening. Audrey introduced me. I am Chua Xiong. I am the Brown County Health Officer. My role is to promote, provide, and protect the health of all Brown County Citizens. I want to thank everyone for sharing your story today. Audrey and I had a discussion and I agreed with her that we should have a public comment open so that you could share your stories again. I have been given the responsibility of reviewing the scientific evidence based literature and making a determination if there is a health hazard as it relates to the Shirley Wind Turbine Project. I have also listened to the concern expressed by the citizens affected by the wind turbines. I empathize with their expressed concerns and cannot imagine the emotional and physical stress they have experienced. I hear you, you're not crazy, it's not in your head, and you're not lying. I want you to know that. As the health officer, I was given the due diligence to determine whether a health hazard can be declared through the existence of past and most current scientific evidence based literature. As a result of my review, I have come to the following conclusion. Presently, there is insufficient scientific evidence based research to support the relationship between wind turbine and health concerns. However, I will continue to keep an open mind and review any new scientific evidence based literature on an annual basis. As the Brown County Health Officer, I will accept and review any new, current, scientific evidence based literature and provide updates on an annual basis regarding significant findings. As a health officer for Brown County Health Department and along with the Board of Health, we are dedicated to promote, provide, and protect the health of all Brown County Citizens. I will continue to monitor the situation and work with the citizens impacted by the wind turbines. Thank you.

**Audrey Murphy:** Thank you Chua. Ah. Board members, do you have questions or comments?

**Richard Schadewald:** Ah, the only thing I would say is that I'm not even sure it has to be annual. I think that many of us, at least my role on the County Board is to continue to educate the Board of Supervisors as to our strategies to help our constituents. I mean, we, um, are looking at all the different options. I would also hope that, I want to talk to the lobbyist. Okay. I think we need to. Obviously, this is a worldwide issue, a national issue and yet here we tend to, we brought it to this point here in Brown County but I don't have any problem going back out saying, "Hey, what other Board of Health's need as far as information." What other state legislator's need. We started the meeting with our, one of our state representatives, I don't know if his Chief of Staff is still here, buy, you know, your gonna have, like you should have, we should have multiple strategies, legislative. Um, I think the medical community has to be involved and I am going to look for strategies for that. I, you know, the different things that have always been the way you have a comprehensive kind of approach to it. So, I don't see Chua's

decision as the end of anything other than the process that we are going through to try and help the people and to look for strategies for that success. Ah, Rick James name, I would like to meet him too now. So, you know, that is what I get out of her decision; that it's not the end but merely part of the process and the journey.

**Chua Xiong:** Can I say something?

**Audrey Murphy:** Sure. Please Chua. I mean, yes.

**Chua Xiong:** I want you to know, all of you have come, testified. I will let you know that it breaks my heart. I have spent thousands of hours. I have gone to the wind turbine out by Shirley and I drove by numerous times, even on Thanksgiving, when I was supposed to be with my family. I was out there on Thanksgiving looking at those wind turbines, listening and trying my best to look at it. What I am looking at is the scientific evidence based research that is there and I hope that you can be patient with me. I don't want you to think that this is a done deal and it's dead. I will continue to monitor it. In my hearts of hearts, I have always been for the little people. All of my life, I will always been the one to face adversity. So, when you come to me and you talk to me, I look at you as if though you were my grandmother, my father, my mother. And I feel your pain as you are sharing that story with me and I am trying to work as fast as I can to try to be on your side and to help you. If you can give me the patience that I need to fight for you and through that finding the Lord has given me the wisdom and the brains to look for the truth. I might not have the evidence today. I said it was insufficient but I didn't say it wasn't there and I will look for that and the truth shall come. I hope you can give me the patience to do that. It might take me 5 years, 10 years but I know it's something that has to be done because I hear you. I hear all the people. Please, be patient with me as I am working on this. Thank you.

**Robert Smurawa:** Well then what can we do...

**Audrey Murphy:** Ah. Sir.

**Robert Smurawa:** ...to help you find the evidence.

**Audrey Murphy:** Sir.

**Robert Smurawa:** ...the scientific evidence. We, as a group of people here. We all have eyes. We all have access to resources. Then tell us what we need to do to help you people up there on the Town Board resolve this issue. We need you. Remember, we realize we're the David going against the Goliath here. And us handful of people in Glenmore stopped a lot of things and made big changes in the area here. We, tell us how we need to help you to get this resolved quickly. We can't wait five years.

**Chua Xiong:** I hear you and those are the strategies in which Rick has said. There's multiple ones. I will continue to work. I have Barb Vanden Boogart. I have Bill Acker. I have all the people that have been talking to me. I will work on that.



**Richard Schadewald:** I can tell you what you need. We need some doctors to follow their Hippocratic Oath and tell us that your pain, your suffering, your illness is caused by the wind turbine. And maybe use the principal he used.

**Jay Tibbetts:** Good. Good luck with that.

**Richard Schadewald:** I know it's good but he asked what you can do. And that's what you have to do. You have to go to your doctors as individuals. The understanding of what can we do, is as much a burden and struggle as what you're talking about.

**Audience Member 2:** I went to my doctor.

**Richard Schadewald:** Yes.

**Audience Member 2:** I've been going to the same doctor since before the turbines went in. She has watched me deplete. She's watched me go downhill. She knows why. She tried to help me. She went to the people that are charge in Fond du Lac County and they wouldn't do anything to help me because they can't prove it. Who is going to do the study? Them? Never. Never. This is all about green and we are the collateral damage. Someone needs to stand up for the little people. Make them do a study.

**Richard Schadewald:** And that was part of the strategy. In fact, we've talked about studies and working with them. But understand this guys. I want you to understand. As much as you're struggling with what can you do, it also comes to us too. What can we do and such and I have nothing, no silver magic bullet to say to anybody other than, I know the process of political legislative. Those kind of things. I am not the, ah, one that can tell you there is a, you know, obviously you people are our friends and neighbors and we, we feel your pain. If we, we're not doing something we think we could do, get it?

**Audrey Murphy:** Mr. Schadewald?

**Richard Schadewald:** Yeah.

**Audrey Murphy:** Can I just respond to that?

**Richard Schadewald:** Sure.

**Audrey Murphy:** And to all of you here.

**Richard Schadewald:** Yeah.

**Audrey Murphy:** Over this 5 year period, this Board. Well, we've done everything I think that we know how and what to do. We did ask for an epidemiological study. It was a formal request. It went to the Public Service Commission and it also went to the State Board of Health, which has another new name. We implored both of them to work together so that a scientific study could and would be done. And we also suggested that UW-Wisconsin Madison be a part of this so that it would have credibility. We got no response. The study was never done. But we requested it and we have documentation for all of this. We passed resolutions which are sitting

somewhere in Madison probably on a shelf somewhere or who knows. So we have attempted all of this and maybe Dr. Tibbetts would like to respond to the medical situation.

**Jay Tibbetts:** Yah. Um, we, um, last year in June sent a letter. It was presented and penned by Audrey and I, presented to the Board of Health, approved and sent to 9, ah, 9 clinics. The three major clinics, ah, Bellin, Aurora and Prevea, ah, and then 6 other clinics that had to do with ENT, ophthalmology, ah, and so on. Ah, of, of the, of the major clinics, one, namely Prevea, the medical director refused to distribute the letter which was from the Board of Health, on Board of Health stationery, refused to distribute it to its providers. Ah, the other clinics, ah, I followed up and they all distributed the, ah, letters to the, ah, to the providers and in fact we did get a referral from one of the provider, one of the provider clinics but when I rudely interrupted, ah, and I apologize, ah, Mr. Schadewald.

**Richard Schadewald:** Oh no.

**Jay Tibbetts:** Ah, my comment was unfortunately well taken when I said good luck with that; because the medical community is not going to help us. We know that. Kicking and screaming, the, ah, AMA, if you look at the AMA stand on wind turbines, they say it's terrific. It saves energy and yada, yada, yada, but, if you look at ICD10 codes which are the codes that your doctor uses to code out you've had a strep throat or whatever. Ah, ICD codes now include, ah, two, ah, entries for, um, vertigo caused by ILFN and this is new, just this year. These codes are written by a committee, a sub-committee of the AMA. So, that's the closest you can get that I can find that the AMA recognizes and I said kicking and screaming, the idea of infrasound causing a, causing an illness. But it's gonna to be a cold day in down below, ah, when the major factions of the medical community get on board.

**Audrey Murphy:** You know. We've, we've. Okay. We've really closed public comments and I just don't think I want to reopen it.

**Jay Tibbetts:** That's okay.

**Audrey Murphy:** Um, Board members do you have any other comments. Um, we've heard you and, and, and you've all had an opportunity to speak.

**Richard Schadewald:** Audrey, can I speak?

**Audrey Murphy:** Yes.

**Richard Schadewald:** Here's what I would tell you you can do. And this is what I plan on doing. Obviously this is going on around the nation. There's many sites in many states, there's many people. At some point you either give up or you move on. I believe we should not give up. I understand it's a struggle. I understand you've tried things. We're trying things. You just heard I've never seen such that these people, ah, the, Doc and Audrey have been working on this for 5 years and, and the amount of work and study, everything, so now you got the choice of giving up, moving ahead, okay, or coming up with greater determination and that's where I'm trying to get you to understand I am coming from. I work on the County Board looking at ordinances, what we can do. I will talk to my [inaudible], I will do that because nothing's gonna

to change. Obviously, Fond du Lac, or I don't what the hell they are doing down there and these other places. I don't know what they're doing there. And I don't have any control on that. So, I am not gonna to just do what they do and that is give up. So that's what I would tell you you could do. Come to future Board of Health meetings. Keep giving literature to Chua. Keep the fight up but, um, those are your choices. You know, when you ask what are you going to do it is always that way. I, you know, um, um, you know, it's either give up, you know, not give up.

**Robert Smurawa:** In six months and then have us all back and hear our stories again and I bet you would hear a completely different story.

**Audrey Murphy:** Okay. Sir. Alright.

**Richard Schadewald:** Well they've been doing it for five years, what's he talking about.

**Audrey Murphy:** I don't know.

**Richard Schadewald:** Oh.

**Audrey Murphy:** Okay. Um, we don't even have an item to adjourn but I think

**Richard Schadewald:** Motion to adjourn.

**Audrey Murphy:** I think we need to do that. Ah, Chua, do you want to add anything else? No?

**Jay Tibbetts:** I do.

**Audrey Murphy:** Okay.

**Jay Tibbetts:** Yah. I, I think that, ah, at this point in time, at least I for one, stand by the, um, human health hazard. Ah, I think that the, ah, state and local ordinance statute and ordinance speak for themselves. Ah, I know that when we, when we, passed this, ah, October 14<sup>th</sup>, ah, it was unanimous, ah, and I for one stand by that. I'm afraid Chua and at least I, as a member, are at odds with, ah, declaring this, ah, human health hazard. Ah, I understand why she wouldn't want to because that demands action and I for one am very disappointed with the, ah, with the response of Chua.

**Audrey Murphy:** Okay. Thank you. Um, I would just add that I think as a Board, ah, we believe that we did the right thing and we'll continue to believe that. Um, I also think that the, ah, state of Wisconsin needs to bear some of the responsibility for, ah, finding us or for, for finding us in this situation because they have not, ah, listened and they haven't taken the action that they could take legislatively via the Public Service Commission. And so I think, um, again if you are looking for some answers which we don't seem to have, ah, contact your legislator and just continue to do it and see if you can get some action in, um, Madison because, um, they are ver, I mean that's legislatively, um, that's what in place at the present time. I thank you all for coming. Um, we did hear you and I hope you felt that you were recognized and listened to and at this time then I think we'll adjourn the meeting. Thank you.

**Steve Delauries:** I have to respond just, just very quickly. If you want to adjourn the meeting I have to [inaudible]. We've heard from a couple Board members that make it sound like we are idling along doing nothing. We've have spent years, years, literally years, thousands of hours, careers affected, families affected, marriages affected, trying to get this stuff done. We can't even get a Board of Health, a health director in our own county to act and you're expecting us to go to our state. We've been going to the state. We've have been talking to our national representatives. Nothing we can do, that's why we are here. We are, we are your friends and neighbors. We can't get action here. How can we get action at the State? We're, we are not idling along Mr. Schadewald we are, we, we have...

**Richard Schadewald:** Yeah.

**Steve Delauries:** ...used the greatest determination. We have done everything possible. We can't get anywhere and our families and friends are suffering. What do we do?

[Inaudible. Several people talking.]

**Richard Schadewald:** And I...if I gave the impression your of idling along, or that, no. Then you misheard what I was trying to say.

**Audience Member 3:** Are you going to help us pay our doctor bills?

**Cathy Johnson:** Why do the victims have to prove that they are unsafe? Why doesn't Duke have to prove they're safe? Why it the...why is it responsible on us to prove that their product is unsafe. Somebody designs a car, they have to have it tested before they can sell it to all of us saying and proving its safe, the brakes work. You know. Everything on it works correctly. It's on the victims to prove they're unsafe. I don't think so. The company needs to prove by shutting them off that they're safe.

**Audrey Murphy:** Alright. Thank you.

MOTION: To adjourn meeting at 7:28 PM

Sanchez / Paulus-Smith

MOTION CARRIED

NEXT MEETING: JANUARY 12, 2016 at 5:00 PM