

**PROCEEDINGS OF THE JOINT MEETING OF THE BOARD OF HEALTH and the
BROWN COUNTY HUMAN SERVICES COMMITTEE**

Pursuant to Section 19.84 Wis. Stats., a joint meeting of the **Board of Health and the Brown County Human Services Committee** was held on Tuesday, May 25, 2010 at the UW Extension Building – 1150 Bellevue Street, Green Bay, Wisconsin

Present: **Human Services Committee Members** - Jesse Brunette, Pat Evans, Pat Moynihan, Pat LaViolette, Carole Andrews

Excused: Steve Fewell, Pat Wetzel

Present: **Board of Health** – Jay Tibbetts, Audrey Murphy, Harold Pfothenauer, Mary Scray, Don Murray

Excused: Joe VanDeurzen, Patricia Bacelis Leon

Also Present: County Executive Tom Hinz and Assistant Jayme Sellen
Judy Friederichs, John Paul/Brown County Health Department
Supervisors Dantine, Schuller, Erickson, Clancy
Chuck Warzecka /Dr. Jeven McFadden– State of Wisconsin
Representatives of Brown County Citizens for Responsible Energy
Media, Other Interested Parties

The meeting was called to order by Chairman Pat Evans at 5:37 p.m.

1. **Comments from the Human Services Committee Chair:**

Chairman Evans explained this meeting is being held for the purpose of providing information from the State of Wisconsin, Invenergy Wind, along with the Brown County Citizens for Responsible Wind Energy (BCCRWE). Questions from the public will be allowed with the focus on health and safety. Information gathered at this meeting will be reviewed by the Board of Health and a conclusion determined. That conclusion will be forwarded to this committee and to the Brown County Board of Supervisors.

2. **Comments from Health Director, Judy Friederichs, on responsibility and authority of the Brown County Health Department:**

Ms. Friederichs, Director of the Brown County Health Department, explained that her involvement came through a request from the Human Services Committee Chairman for guidance on this issue. She stated that the Health Department is bound by State Statute and when there is an issue new to the department which may cross County boundaries, they will approach the State for recommendations, which is the case here.

3. **Presentation by the State of Wisconsin:**

Chuck Warzecka, Director of Environmental Health, with the Wisconsin Department of Health Services, was introduced by Chairman Evans.

Mr. Warzecka informed those present that there is little information available on the issue of health and safety related to wind turbines, therefore, he has relied on

research available in the national forum. At this time, the State has not taken a position.

Mr. Warzecka reported that research of scientific literature on wind energy projects and public health, as well as reports issued by the National Academy of Sciences and other state health departments find no clear scientific evidence to support the conclusion that wind turbine development using existing setback criteria would result in specific adverse health impacts to the public. Warzecka stated that when discussing this topic with local health officials in other counties, it was determined that where wind energy projects have been undertaken, the majority of complaints received have been related to nuisance including noise, sleep disruption, and shadow flicker. Warzecka pointed out that these symptoms could be attributed to many other factors, therefore, the State has taken the position that individuals with these complaints first seek evaluation by a medical provider.

Dr. Jevon McFadden confirmed this information, concurring that anyone with such symptoms should first see their doctor.

4. **Presentation by Invenergy Wind:**

A statement was read by Matthew Thornton representing Invenergy Wind, basically stating that wind farms in the United States have outstanding records for promoting community safety and well-being. There are more than 20,000 wind turbines currently operational in the U.S. and there is evidence nationwide that wind turbines are safe and produce no negative health affects. He highlighted benefits of the proposed Ledge Wind Farm including payments to farmers and landowners, new tax revenues to local governments, the generation of pollution free electricity, the production of in-state electricity, and the creation of 150 construction jobs and 15 permanent maintenance jobs (attached).

In addition, he stated that the Public Service Commission of Wisconsin has opined that there is evidence showing wind farms are safe, healthy, and beneficial. The PSC will hold public hearings in the coming months to address issues related to wind farms, including health and safety. Invenergy will continue to work with local officials in Brown County to finalize the Ledge Wind Farm layout and construction plans.

5. **Presentation by Brown County Citizens for Responsible Wind Energy:**

Carl Kuehne – 4479 Heritage Hts, DePere – Presented a list of requests to the Brown County Board and Board of Health which included that the erection of industrial wind turbines within Brown County be prohibited pending the completion and review of an epidemiological study of the health affects of their placement, including setback and noise level guidelines.

Dr. Herb Coussons, 6649 Lidgetop Drive, Greenleaf – Stated that studies that have been done in the U.S., Canada, New Zealand, and Europe have resulted in the conclusion that “*large industrial wind turbine developments do not belong in close proximity to locations where people live and work*”. Dr. Coussons indicated that the safest minimum sound level and distance to protect health and safety is to allow for less than 40dB which correlates to 0.5 miles or 2640 feet. The

optimal distance in a rural setting would allow for no more than a 10dB increase in ambient noise which would correlate to just over one mile.. Additional information was provided and is included in this document.

Tim Harmann – 4544 Mill Road, Denmark – Mr. Harmann visited with ten land owners in the Fond du Lac area who live in the area of wind turbines. He showed a video of his interviews with people who had complaints of noise, loss of sleep, loss of TV service, shadow flicker, and overall increased stress.

James Felmer – 1135 Clemtine Road, Green Bay - Mr. Felmer stated he is a non-participant, however, is surrounded by wind turbines, the closest being 1600 feet. He has experienced sleeplessness, vibration, noise, headaches. He has noticed that his farm animals are effected, laying less eggs, less fertility with cattle, spooky horses, loss of birds and wildlife. Although he has attempted to sell his home, he has been unable to.

Allen Haas – Stated that he hosts 3 turbines through WE Energies. He has noticed that his corn crops in the proximity of the turbines grew about 4 feet shorter than those further away. He also reported issues with noise, memory loss, poor attitude, less ambition, no interest. He stated that airplanes refuse to fly in the area of the turbines, so he has been unable to spray his crops. He is unable to open his windows due to the noise and shadow flickers, the house vibrates, and he has TV problems.

Ann Wertz – 324 Oakview Circle, Oakfield, WI – Ms. Wertz stated that she and her husband bought a farm house which they renovated near a wind turbine farm. She had severe sleep disturbance, and her daughter experienced stomach problems and other symptoms. Although the property was valued at \$350,000, they walked away from it to save their health.

Jon Morehouse, 4432 Mill Road, Denmark – Mr. Morehouse owns 137 acres in Morrison. He was approached by Invernergy to place turbines on his land. He researched their impact and discovered the physical risks of turbines because of the distance they are placed from residences. He pointed out occurrences with ice on the blades causing failure and flying ice, injuries from lightening, and even reports where the whole turbine tipped over.

Kristen Morehouse – W2046 Hannah Lane, Sheboygan – Also owns property in the Morrison area. She addressed groundwater concerns in this area of karst features and bedrock fractures, which have caused ground/well contamination in the past. She presented diagrams showing how the turbines are installed and how that disturbs the bedrock. In her opinion, turbines in this area would be improper placement.

Steve Deslauriers, 8042 Holly-Mor Road - Mr. Deslauriers presented a petition with approximately 890 signatures asking that the State study the adverse effects to people before proceeding with approval of additional industrial wind projects. (Available in County Clerk and County Board offices)

Brown County Supervisor Kris Schuller – Suggested that the Wisconsin DNR address the issues of karst features in this area and concerns with well contamination.

Brown County Supervisor Bill Clancy – Suggested that the PSC be invited to attend a meeting to address citizen concerns.

Brown County Supervisor Norb Dantine – Questioned why the PSC and Invenergy would not air on the side of safety.

6. **Comments from the Public:**

The following people addressed the Board of Health and Human Services Committee relative to their concerns with the placement of wind turbines because of reports of health and safety issues, and groundwater concerns.

Dan Vercauteren – 7566 County Road W, Greenleaf

Dave & Lynn Kornick –1316 Rockledge Road, Mishicot

Gerry Meyer – W6249 Cty Rd Y, Brownsville, WI

Lee Leiterman – 4433 Mill Road, Denmark

Troy VerHheyen – 3023 Park Road, Greenleaf

Dave Klug – 7214 Pleasant View Road, Morrison

Bruce Wendt – 2931 Ridge Court, Greenleaf

Mark Deslaurius – 8042 Holly-Mor Road, Greenleaf

David Vercauteren – 3410 Park Road, Greenleaf

Jim Michels

Kelly Burke – 7155 Holly-Mor, Greenleaf

Barbara VandenBoogert – 7663 Holly-Mor, Greenleaf

Glen Schwalbach – Probit Consulting, LCC, 1090 Moonriver Drive, DePere

Arnie Adams - Greenleaf

Richard Koltz – 2372 Day Street, Greenleaf – Mr. Koltz indicated that he signed up as a host with Invenergy before doing any research. As time went on and he learned more, he tried to get out of his contract with them, however, as of this date Invenergy has refused.

State Representatives Chuck Warzecka and Dr. Jeven McFadden informed the public speakers that they would address their concerns, however, Dr. McFadden again encouraged anyone with symptoms to see their doctor so that a baseline can be established.

7. **Such Other Matters as Authorized by Law:**

Handouts

Article by Neil Steinberg – Chicago SunTimes

“Winds of Change Inevitably Get the Hot Air Stirring”

Invenergy Wind LLC Statement on Health & Safety

Public Service Commission of WI – Final Order, Docket 6630-CE-302

May 6, 2010 Letter to Liv Moyer, Eden, WI from Seth Foldy, State Health Officer & Administrator - Wisconsin Dept of Health Services, Division of Health

May 13, 2010 Letter from Attorney Edward Marion, Madison to Seth Foldy. Mr. Marion represents the Brown County Citizens for Responsible Wind Energy, Inc. (BCCRWE)

Report by Dr. Christopher Hanning on Sleep Disturbance and Wind Turbine Noise on behalf of Stop Swinford Wind Farm Action Group – June 2009

Summary of Recent Research on Adverse Health Effects of Wind Turbines – October 20, 2009

Health Effects of Wind Turbine Noise by Nina Pierpont, MD, PhD – March 2, 2006

Noise Guidelines for Europe – Final Implementation Report by the European Centre for Environment and Health, Bonn Office, World Health Organization, Regional Office for Europe – 2007

Night Noise Guidelines for Europe – Executive Summary

Addresses:

- Process of Developing Guidelines
- Noise Indicators
- Sleep Time
- Noise, Sleep & Health Vulnerable Groups
- Thresholds for Observed Effects
- Relations with L Night, Outside
- Recommendations for Health Protection
- Relation with the Guidelines for Community Noise

Requests of Brown County Citizens for Responsible Wind Energy

Letter to the Board of Health from Brown County Citizens for Responsible Wind Energy – Steve Deslauriers

Copy of Power Point Presentation of Dr. Herbert Coussons re: Health Impact and Setback Guidelines for Wind Siting Council

Petition - Approximately 890 Signatures for Wind Turbine Moratorium

Motion made by Supervisor LaViolette and seconded by Board of Health Member, Audrey Murphy at 11:00 p.m. MOTION APPROVED UNANIMOUSLY

Respectfully submitted,

Rae G. Knippel
Recording Secretary